# **EXHIBIT 5**

1	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2	FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
3	
4	BLACK LOVE RESISTS IN THE RUST, et al.,
5	individually and on behalf of a class of all others similarly situated,
6	Plaintiffs,
7	-vs- 1:18-cv-00719-CCR
8	CITY OF BUFFALO, N.Y., et al.,
9	Defendants.
10	DEPOSITION OF DANIEL DERENDA
11	Taken pursuant to Rule 30(b)(6)
12	of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure
13	APPEARING REMOTELY FROM
14	BUFFALO, NEW YORK
15	
16	(ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY PAGES 138 - 142)
17	
18	January 23rd, 2024
19	At 9:30 a.m.
20	Pursuant to notice
21	
22	REPORTED BY:
23	Rebecca L. DiBello, RPR, CSR(NY)

-DEPAOLO CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC. —

- matter in details of conversations that
  happened with counsel. So you can answer that
  limited question.
  - A. I don't recall exactly what he would have educated me on the section.
  - Q. Okay. So let's turn to the Strike Force. The Strike Force was created during your time as BPD commissioner, correct?
  - A. Correct.
- 10 Q. With your approval?
- 11 A. Yes.

4

5

6

7

8

9

- Q. What year was the Strike Force created, to your recollection?
  - A. 2013.
- Q. And the Strike Force began as a detail and then became a permanent unit of the BPD, correct?
- A. It became -- I don't recall if it started as a detail or not, but it was posted for a permanent unit I believe in March of 2013.
- 21 Q. Okay.
- 22 A. Again, I might be off on the date.
- 23 O. And the mission of the Strike Force was to

target guns, drugs and crime, correct?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form.

You may answer.

- A. The mission of the Strike Force was to target violent crime in crime hot spots. It's listed on the posting.
- Q. Okay. And also gangs?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form.

- A. It would target violent crime, period. It could include gang members, yes, and all crimes, all violent crime and crime hot spots.
- Q. Okay. There was also an explicit mission to remove illegal guns from the streets, correct?
- A. That is part of the function of all patrol officers and officers out there, to remove guns, yes, correct.
- Q. But that was also a stated objective of the Strike Force per its mission statement?
- A. I don't believe that was in the posting.
- Q. I'd like to mark as the third exhibit for this deposition a document that was produced in discovery as COB 060319. It was also the first exhibit in your non 30(b)(6) deposition.

Are you able to see that on your screen,

Mr. Derenda?

- A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. Do you recognize this document?
- A. I do.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

16

17

18

19

20

21

- Q. Is this the official mission statement of the Strike Force?
  - A. I believe -- yeah, there was a posting. I believe that was the mission statement, correct.
- Q. It's actually a mission statement that you helped prepare?
- 13 A. I probably prepared it.
- Q. And it accurately describes the mission of the Strike Force?
  - A. Target and eliminate criminal hot spots throughout the city. Yes. Guns, zero tolerance crime policy. Yes.
  - Q. So to ask my question again, one of the stated purposes of the Strike Force was to remove illegal guns from the streets of Buffalo, correct?
- A. Under the mission statement, correct.

- Q. Now, traffic safety was not listed as one of the four missions of the Strike Force on the mission statement, correct?
  - A. It's not listed on this mission statement.
  - Q. Okay. Now, let's turn to the activities the Strike Force engaged in while it was in existence. Once established the Strike Force was designed to target patrol areas, correct?

    MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

Can you restate?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- Q. Once established the Strike Force had assigned patrol areas, correct?
  - A. They had assigned areas, correct.
- Q. Areas that were referred to as patrols?

  MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form.
  - A. I'm not understanding.
  - Q. Did you call the areas that the Strike Force was assigned to patrol locations or patrol areas?
    - A. Areas. Like they were by number.
  - Q. Okay. And the majority of the patrol areas were on the East Side?
    - A. I believe it broke down the city by different

- A. I would be copied on a daily Strike Force report so, yes, I would review those reports periodically, so I would have been made aware of.
- Q. Okay. And if you had concerns or objections to the patrol locations you could have voiced those concerns, correct?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- Q. Did you ever?
- A. I don't recall.
- Q. And there were others in the BPD who received
  Strike Force daily reports, correct?
  - A. It would be -- yes, that's correct.
    - Q. Who were those individuals by job title?
    - A. I don't remember the total who would be on it, but it would be district chiefs at the time.

      The deputy commissioners would receive it. I would receive it. Strike Force lieutenants would receive it. Captains, all chiefs. That would probably be the chain. I don't recall exactly who would be on that chain.
      - Q. Okay.

- A. I didn't educate myself on that prior to.
- Q. But in any event, members of BPD's leadership including the commissioner received the daily reports?
  - A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

- Q. What was the function of the Strike Force daily reports?
- A. Of the daily reports?
- Q. Yes.
- 10 A. To know what was being done. My philosophy is
  11 what gets measured gets done.
  - Q. So as commissioner you were briefed on a daily basis about the Strike Force's activities in the City of Buffalo, correct?
  - A. I was sent a daily report. Whether I read it daily or not, sometimes, sometimes not.
    - Q. Okay. But you were nonetheless given notice about the activities the Strike Force was engaged in in the City of Buffalo?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form.

- A. I was sent the daily report.
- Q. Okay. And that was a practice that was instituted during your time as commissioner of

#### —DANIEL DERENDA —

- MS. EZIE: Okay. I'm just making a record.
  - Q. Now, the primary focus of the Housing Unit was crime prevention, correct?
    - A. In and around the housing complexes.
    - Q. So the primary focus of the Housing Unit was crime prevention in and around BMHA housing units?
  - A. In and around the complexes. They were to patrol those areas.
    - Q. And by housing complexes you mean Buffalo

      Municipal Housing Authority complexes or BMHA

      property?
    - A. Right.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

22

- Q. Their patrol zone was not just limited to the units, but included the surrounding areas?
- A. They would be patrolling the units and the surrounding areas, correct.
- Q. Up to about half a mile circumference around the properties?
- MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form.
  - A. I don't think we ever put a limit on how far away they could patrol. Again, they would go

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

25

#### -DANIEL DERENDA -

to and from so, again, I don't ever remember a number being placed on that.

- Q. Okay. So during the time that you were commissioner they were authorized to patrol the housing complexes as well as any of the neighborhoods that they passed through on their way to the housing complexes?
- A. They would have city-wide jurisdiction, correct.
- Q. Okay. And in addition to crime prevention their focus was drug interdiction, correct?
- A. Their focus was being police officers and enforcing all laws.
- Q. Okay. But they still were subject to a contract with the BMHA, correct?
- A. There was a contract with BMHA, correct.
  - Q. And that contract indicated that their primary focuses would be criminal investigations and drug interdiction, correct?
  - A. Their primary focus would be crime. I don't have the contract. I did not review the contract prior to this meeting. It wasn't one of the stated topics, but their objective

whether it was Housing, whether it was individual district details, they were all made to do daily reports that I would have been copied on.

- Q. Okay. And so as commissioner you were made aware of the Housing Unit's patrol location?
- A. I would have been sent a copy of the report which would have made me aware had I read the report.
- Q. Okay. Why was that a practice of the BPD?
- A. I don't understand. Why was it a practice to have the reports? 12
  - Q. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

A. What gets measured gets done. I want to know people are out there working doing what they're supposed to be doing. I always liked to keep a handle on what was going on throughout the city.

Again, I had numerous reports just about for every detail. Every unit would send reports and, again, did I read all of them? No. Did I go through them?

O. What else was contained on these daily reports

besides patrol locations?

- A. Probably would be the number of arrests, the number of summonses, any parking tickets, any city ordinance tickets. Just numbers in general. Anything that happened that night of interest, special interest, guns recovered, whatever. It would be a report to know what happened that night within the unit or detail.
- Q. Okay. And as you testified, BPD commissioner -- the BPD commissioner received these reports, correct?
- A. Yes.

- Q. Who else in BPD leadership received these reports?
  - A. It would be the same chain of command, whether it was detail reports, Strike Force reports, the deputy commissioners, the commissioners, the chiefs received the reports because whether it was Strike Force or Housing, it could have been something taking place in their district, the district chiefs, and then the leadership of the units.
  - O. Okay. Now, the Strike Force was disbanded in

#### -DANIEL DERENDA -

quote unquote. In speaking to Gramaglia and the other individuals, they didn't recall the term either.

- Q. Okay. We'll get to that momentarily, but is your indication that you are more or less relying on personal knowledge for Topic 3 because the person you contacted did not have information pertinent?
- A. No. I'm not saying they didn't have information for that, but the use of traffic enforcement is general. Like I can answer that from personal knowledge on what I believe why we did traffic enforcement.
- Q. Okay. Okay. So let's again -- so once the Strike Force was established it began operating checkpoints, correct?
- A. At some point it operated checkpoints, correct.
- Q. The Strike Force after establishment also began engaging in traffic enforcement?
- A. No. The Strike Force would -- traffic enforcement would be part of their job just like any other patrol units that do patrol.

Whether district patrols, housing patrols,
Strike Force patrols, traffic enforcement is
part of their patrols and in general as to
Topic 3, traffic enforcement to me is part of
proactive policing, part of the mayor's zero
tolerance crime policy and part of high
visibility and I believe being out there
enforcing all laws, be it traffic, be it Penal
Law, whatever, is part of their job.

- Q. Okay. And Mr. Derenda, are you reading from something in front of you?
- A. I am not. The only thing I have in front of me are the topics that you have.
  - Q. Okay. So you said a lot there, but I just want to confirm that we have agreement that the Strike Force during its period of operation engaged in traffic enforcement, correct?
  - A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

- Q. And it also operated checkpoints, correct?
- A. Correct.
- Q. Now, the Strike Force operated checkpoints as part of the mayor's plan to deal with gang and

#### -DANIEL DERENDA -

chief and/or the captains, but most likely communicated to the chiefs.

Q. And when the Strike Force operated checkpoints it was part of the mayor's plan to deal with gang and gun violence, correct?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form. Asked and answered. Go ahead.

- A. The mayor's zero tolerance crime policy was to go after all crime, period, separate from the Strike Force. Part of the Strike Force in my opinion was implementing zero tolerance crime policy on all, whether it's traffic tickets, whether it's city ordinances, whether it's any crime it's part of the zero tolerance crime policy.
- Q. Okay. And during your time as commissioner there was such a thing as the plan to address gang and gun violence, correct?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Object to the form of the question. Go ahead.

A. Possibly, but I don't recall any specifics at this point, but yes, we did want to address gang and gun violence, yes.

## -DANIEL DERENDA this grant which the officers would have 2 performed. O. Thank you. Now, moving on, when the Strike Force operated checkpoints they received assistance at times from the Housing Unit, correct? A. Correct. O. The Strike Force and Housing Unit also engaged in traffic enforcement outside of checkpoints, correct? A. It would be part of their duties on patrol to enforce traffic, correct. 12 13 Q. So they engaged in these activities with your 14 knowledge and permission? 15 A. Yes. Including on the East Side? Q. Including all parts of the City of Buffalo.

- 16
- 17 Α.
  - O. And that includes the East Side?
- 19 A. Correct.

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

18

20 Q. Now, as BPD commissioner you participated in 21 the decision to deploy the Strike Force for 22 use in traffic enforcement, correct?

23 MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form.

- A. As I stated, traffic enforcement was a function of all patrol units including the Strike Force, housing district patrols, traffic patrols, whatever. It's part of their daily job for any officer out doing patrol.
- Q. So they engage in these activities with your knowledge and approval, correct?
- A. Correct.

- Q. The checkpoints -- the Strike Force and

  Housing Unit also participated in checkpoints

  with your knowledge and approval?
  - MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form. I think he's already told you they did. Go ahead.
- A. Yes.
- Q. Now, did the mayor play any role in the decision to deploy the Strike Force and Housing Unit to engage in checkpoint?
  - MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form. I'm also going to state again I don't see what topic this relates to, but you can answer.
- A. The mayor didn't play a role in our plans. He was always made aware of what we were doing.

- Again, the plans usually came from myself through my command staff, whatever we did.
- Q. But you notified the mayor of the decision to use -- to operate checkpoints in the City of Buffalo, correct?
- A. I'm positive he knew we were running checkpoints in the City of Buffalo and I'm sure I told him we were doing so.
- Q. Did the mayor ever object to your decision to operate checkpoints in the City of Buffalo?

  MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.
- A. I have no recollection of that.
  - Q. Now, as part of their work the Housing Unit engaged in traffic enforcement at or near BMHA properties, correct?
  - A. That would be correct.
- Q. And as part of that work they stopped and questioned motorists?
- MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Motorists?
  - O. Correct.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

20

21

22

23

A. As part of their job it would be to enforce

Vehicle and Traffic Law which in fact would

stop motorists for whatever violation,

correct.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. Housing Unit officers were also instructed to stop anyone they believed to be a gang member, correct?
  - MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form.
- A. I don't recall that to be correct.
- Q. But you're aware that the Housing Unit had a Captain Serafini?
- A. There was a Captain Serafini, correct.
- Q. Was Captain Serafini authorized to provide instructions to Housing Unit officers during their patrols?
- A. He was the captain in that unit. He would have the right to instruct them, correct.
- Q. Okay. I'd like to mark as Exhibit 7 a document that was produced in discovery as COB 044624.
  - MR. SAHASRABUDHE: What topic are we on right now?
    - MS. EZIE: We're on Topic 2 and 3.
- Q. Mr. Derenda, this is a three-page memorandum that was authored by -- it's two pages and a blank page -- Captain Phillip M. Serafini of

DEPAOLO CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC.

authorize this plan, correct?

A. Apparently, correct.

- Q. And you gave her authorization with the exception of a request for overtime, correct?
- A. It says okay for plan except the lieutenant on overtime. You have two lieutenants working assigned shifts, one to the detail, but not bringing one in, correct.
- Q. For clarity, this is not describing the use of roadblocks for traffic safety, is it?
- A. It's what she wrote. Utilize traffic and AIU to perform roadblocks for safety checks on highly travelled areas in the districts. Then she says vehicles are involved in the majority of shootings with subjects firing from moving cars. The use of roadblocks may lead to interdiction of the subjects and their weapons.

As I stated earlier, the purpose of roadblocks are traffic safety and high visibility and at times those roadblocks did lead to other crimes and in the directive I believe it says look for any and all

#### -DANIEL DERENDA -

violations of V&T and other laws, so at times they could have been -- you know, they could have gotten different results other than the traffic stop.

Q. But for clarity, during your time as commissioner you expressly approved the use of roadblocks whose primary purpose was crime interdiction, correct?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: I object to the form of the question. Go ahead.

A. Roadblocks are for the express purpose of traffic safety and high visibility. As I stated, high visibility has an effect and the authorization of roadblocks for traffic safety and a high visibility effect has the deterrence on violent crime and other crimes in the area so, again, if they're setting up in an area -- highly traveled area with roadblocks and where there's issues of shootings going on, when they're setting up these shootings will not likely happen so, again, it's about traffic safety, secondary high visibility.

are the clubhouses and their clubhouses are ones -- that doesn't mean they hang out in that area, but they do go to their clubhouses. Those are the only ones I can think of that were predominantly White.

Q. Thank you. Okay.

So now I would like to turn back to the subject of checkpoints. You testified earlier that during your time as commissioner you aspired to have the checkpoints conducted daily in the City of Buffalo, correct?

- A. With the Strike Force or Housing, correct.
- Q. Okay. And that was policy that was rolled out when initially?
  - A. Probably right after the formation of the Strike Force. Whenever the Strike Force started that is when they started doing checkpoints.
  - Q. Okay. So the checkpoint program as -- the daily checkpoint program as described dates back as far as 2013 in the City of Buffalo?
  - A. Again, I'm sure there were checkpoints before that, but Strike Force used to conduct them

- daily or they were requested to do them daily.

  Didn't always happen for whatever reasons.
  - Q. And so Strike Force -- the Strike Force was involved in the operation of checkpoints in 2013, correct?
- 6 A. Yes. I believe so.
  - Q. They were involved in the operation of checkpoints in 2014?
- 9 A. Yes.

3

4

5

7

8

- 10 Q. 2015?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. 2016?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. 2017?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Any times after 2017?
- 17 A. I don't believe so.
- Q. Okay. Was the Housing Unit involved in the operation of checkpoints in the 2013 to 2017 period?
- 21 A. I'll make the assumption, yes.
- Q. Has the BPD conducted any checkpoints since the Strike Force's dissolution?

-DEPAOLO CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC.

#### -DANIEL DERENDA

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Form.

- A. When it was necessary when it should be done, yes.
- Q. While operating checkpoints, correct?
- A. While operating checkpoints they should enforce all the V&T rules, all laws and it should be done on every vehicle that comes through so everybody is treated equally.
- Q. Okay. So conducting impounds was part of the expected role of officers operating at Strike Force checkpoints?
  - MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.
- A. It wasn't expected, but if they impound the vehicle it would be part of what they did for various reasons through the checkpoint.
- Q. It's something that you tracked as far as data is concerned?
- A. I believe they might have put down the number of impounds on the report. I don't recall exactly, but they would track all the numbers whether it was traffic summonses, number of misdemeanor arrests, felony arrests, guns recovered. There might have been impounds on

-DEPAOLO CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC.

and every car you see is going over 30 miles an hour. So if they were out there eight hours and they wrote no tickets they weren't trying very hard and I would address situations like that with the chief.

- Q. And so it was your practice to give feedback on the production of the Strike Force and Housing Unit?
- A. Correct.

- Q. And it was your practice to complain if production was ever too low, correct? MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form. Go ahead.
- A. I would want to know -- there would be reasons at times why they weren't -- maybe they didn't have the manpower. Maybe they were doing something different than their normal duties so, again, we keep track and make sure people were doing what they were being paid to do.
- Q. But you would notify the command if you thought the numbers were not good, correct?
- A. I'm positive I did that on probably more than one occasion.

proceed on all of the above.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. Would you expect that BPD chiefs would be aware of those legal requirements?
- A. Yes, I do. I would expect they would be.
- Q. Does it concern you that chiefs gave instructions to officers contrary to those legal requirements?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection to form.

- A. I'd have to see when it happened. Again, I don't kn,ow. I don't know what you're talking about so I really can't answer on that.
- Q. Okay. You also during your time as commissioner instructed BPD officers engaged in traffic enforcement to make arrests and write traffic summonses as much as possible, correct?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form.

A. Actually, that's on the directive to write as many tickets and violations as you see. We'll go back to the checkpoints for a minute.

They're supposed to tag every violation that they see and make every arrest for every violation of the criminal, or whatever.

### DEPAOLO CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC.

Again, you can't -- you see one person not wearing a seatbelt, he should get a tag just like every other person coming through that checkpoint.

I encouraged them to be proactive, especially on the checkpoint situation that they weren't given a choice but to write as many tickets as possible based on what they see and to treat everybody the same.

- Q. Is that departmental policy?
- A. That was on a checkpoint directive to tag
  every violation they see was because I don't
  want motorist A to be treated any different
  than motorist B, so I wrote one ticket for
  motorist A when he had four violations, but on
  motorist B I wrote five violation tickets, but
  not the same.

I wanted everybody treated the same, tagged for every violation that came through.

- Q. So your testimony is that you wanted all motorists in the City of Buffalo to be treated the same with respect to traffic enforcement?
- A. Correct.

- Q. So during your time as commissioner did you ever have a policy requiring that if the Strike Force performed four checkpoints or five checkpoints that they would be in each of the five police districts in the City of Buffalo?
- A. I don't believe that was the case at all. We moved them around. Again, over the years different people had input on where they went, but there was no keeping track of I did one in A, I did one in B, I did one C, D and E. I don't believe that took place, no.
- Q. Why not?

A. Again, a lot of the checkpoints were done for convenience of where they were assigned so it made it easier for them to setup where they were as opposed to moving to the other side of the city.

Again, it was about traffic safety. It was about high visibility, but at times it was easier just for them to setup wherever they were assigned.

O. Are there traffic safety issues in A District?

through.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- Q. But you did not adopt a policy of ensuring that checkpoints were distributed evenly across districts in the city, correct?
- A. Checkpoints, no, I did not. Checkpoints primarily were with Strike Force and Housing and, as I said, many times for the sake of convenience they were done in the areas that they were assigned.
- Q. Am I correct that the Strike Force had city-wide jurisdiction?
- 12 A. They did.
- Q. Am I correct that the Housing Unit has city-wide jurisdiction?
- 15 A. They did.
  - Q. But you did not instruct the Strike Force or
    Housing Unit to ensure that checkpoints took
    place in all neighborhoods across the City of
    Buffalo, correct?
    - MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form.
  - A. Checkpoints were part of the daily duties of the Strike Force. No, I did not tell them to go to every different part. Again, they were

#### -DANIEL DERENDA

assigned to target areas based on crime stats, based on crime issues, based on issues and for the sake of convenience I believe they did a lot of their checkpoints in those areas that they were assigned.

Rather than packing up, going to the other side of the city for an hour and then coming back to where they were assigned, many times I believe they did it where they were assigned.

- Q. Is your testimony that traffic safety violations only occur in certain city neighborhoods?
- A. No. They occur all over the city and county and everywhere else.
  - Q. So if the goal of the checkpoints is traffic safety why weren't the checkpoints administered by the Strike Force across all city neighborhoods?
    - MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form.
  - A. They probably at one point were in all different neighborhoods. Again, breaking it up by the numbers, I don't have the numbers,

-DEPAOLO CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC.

- A. Correct.
- Q. Is that a policy that was -- was that the policy of the Buffalo Police Department during your time as commissioner?
- A. Yes.

- Q. Was it a policy that was enforced?

  MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form.
- A. Yes.
- Q. So were all of the checkpoints operated by the Strike Force during their tenure checkpoints that were approved with the express permission of an inspector, a chief, a deputy police commissioner or the police commissioner?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form.

A. It would have been all approved by me. It was part of their duties and they were expected to do it. That was what they were told to do and whether they did it on Monday, Tuesday,

Wednesday and didn't do one on Friday because they didn't have the manpower, that was an expectation of what their units were supposed to do, so with the express permission they could set up a checkpoint on any given time.

- They had my permission to do it as part of their job duties.
- Q. And when you refer to they you're referring to the Strike Force as well as the Housing Unit?
- A. Correct.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

- Q. They operated checkpoints inclusive of -- they operated checkpoints with your express permission, correct?
- A. Correct.
- Q. And that was inclusive of the locations where they operated their checkpoints?
  - A. That would be whatever locations were determined. As I said, it was done in different ways, but they would have the ability to do that, correct.
  - Q. You had the authority as commissioner to choose checkpoint locations, correct?
- 18 A. Correct.
- Q. You indicated that other individuals chose them -- chose locations as well, correct?
  - A. Correct.
- Q. Was that pursuant to a delegation of authority
  -- of your authority as commissioner?

A. The authority would have been delegated down to -- I believe it was stated in that section of the MOP. So an inspector who didn't talk to me could authorize a checkpoint and I would find out about it later and find out that, yes, it was authorized by an inspector for whatever reason, but as far as Strike Force and Housing, they had my express authority to setup daily checkpoints and they were expected to do so wherever possible.

Q. Got it.

And was that authority, was that an omnibus grant of authority or did the policy require you to individually approve each and every checkpoint that was conducted?

- A. I did not have to approve -- again, it was express authority to do checkpoints daily and the locations wasn't part of that. As I said, locations were picked for some reasons or no reasons. They were moved around for no other reason than it was convenience.
- Q. So is your testimony that the MOP requiring authorization or permission to operate

#### -DANIEL DERENDA

probably would have been in connection with the state police, but other than that I don't believe any checkpoints have been conducted since 2017.

- Q. Have concerns related to traffic safety been eradicated in the City of Buffalo since 2017?
- A. Traffic safety is always a concern in the City of Buffalo and elsewhere.
- Q. So why haven't traffic safety checkpoints, using air quotes, for traffic safety been conducted in the City of Buffalo since 2017?
- A. They don't have the units to do them. Again, if you don't have a unit that's not tied to the radio it's very hard to do. Within a district when people are going from call to call not likely that they'll be able to put together a checkpoint.

No more Traffic Unit, no more Strike

Force, no more Housing Unit and I believe even

the Traffic Unit was disbanded sometime -- it

might have been in 2018, so it would be very

difficult to do.

Q. Did the Buffalo Police Department perform any

#### -DANIEL DERENDA

analyses to determine if the checkpoint program was contributing to traffic safety during its period of operation?

A. We did not. Again, we didn't do evaluations on effective checkpoints. Checkpoints were part of what I wanted them to do everyday for the reason of traffic safety and high visibility. There were no evaluations done on checkpoints.

However, I did do evaluations on the overall effectiveness of the Strike Force and I did that by looking at crime trends and statistics and seeing where they were located and see how the numbers come down from what was going on, so if you had a series of events in an area where they were assigned and the robberies dropped for whatever reason they were there for, if the numbers went down I seen that as being effective and, as I stated earlier, at the time I was deputy commissioner to the time I left overall crime fell 40 percent, so I believe we were quite effective.

Q. To the extent that crime fell in the City of

#### -DANIEL DERENDA

Buffalo by 40 percent, you attribute that to the Strike Force in part?

- A. Yeah. They're a part of it. All the different things we did. Everything from details to surveillance cameras to everything throughout the city. Every little thing we did was for the purpose of -- even block club meetings, gathering with block clubs, everything we did was for the express purpose of making the city a safer place to live, work and raise a family and I believe we accomplished that.
- Q. To the extent that crimes in the City of

  Buffalo in your testimony or in your words

  decreased by 40 percent, do you attribute that
  to the Strike Force checkpoints in part?
- A. I attribute part again to the whole -everything we did with the Strike Force.

  Other initiatives and checkpoints were only a
  small part of what the Strike Force did.
- Q. Did you keep any measure as part of your crime statistics as to reductions in traffic safety issues in the City of Buffalo?

- A. I did not keep metrics on traffic safety issues.
- Q. Why not?

- A. Because I didn't.
  - Q. Why did you feel it was important to track traffic safety statistics if you were running a multiyear program that in your words has the focus of improving traffic safety?
  - A. We had a focus of reducing crime throughout the city which we accomplished. Traffic safety, if we came across numbers of accidents the chief said, oh, we're having numerous accidents here, we would address it with different issues.

We addressed speeding on the 198 when the speed limit went down, so different issues were addressed for traffic safety reasons. We didn't keep track of numbers as I do with the crime statistics that are mandated to report to the federal authorities and are published by the federal authorities.

Crime statistics are one thing. Traffic statistics are a different thing, but whenever

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

#### -DANIEL DERENDA

we seen issues with traffic safety we would work to resolve those issues to different needs.

- Q. Has the BPD issued any directives that prohibit the use of BPD checkpoints going forward?
- A. There's -- not that I'm aware of that they've issued a directive that prohibits. It is still in the Manual of Procedure, but they would have to obtain permission to do so as stated in the Manual of Procedure.
- Q. So checkpoints -- a daily checkpoint program could be re-established tomorrow provided that the chief, the commissioner, the director or the deputy police commissioner signed off, correct?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form.

A. A daily checkpoint initiative would more than likely come from the commissioner of police.

If he chose to put together a unit, if he wanted to resurrect the Strike Force tomorrow, that is his prerogative. If he wanted to do daily checkpoints starting tomorrow that is

# -DANIEL DERENDA 1 his prerogative. But as of now there is no 2 checkpoint. There is no Strike Force unit at 3 this time. 4 MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Can we take a 5 five-minute break? MS. EZIE: Sure thing. Let's come back 6 at 2:40. 7 8 9 (Recess taken.) 10 11 Q. Now, Mr. Derenda, as part of this deposition you were asked to identify or prepare 12 13 information regarding the criteria used to 14 select checkpoints, correct? A. Checkpoint locations, correct. 15 16 Q. Are you prepared to testify about that today? 17 A. About checkpoint locations? Q. And the specific criteria? 18 19 A. The criteria, yes. Q. And Mr. Derenda, we also asked you to prepare 20 21 for Topic 11, the responses the City gave to 22 the Buffalo Common Council, Police Advisory 23 Board and the Attorney General's office

#### -DANIEL DERENDA

asking me from '21 if what I said back then is consistent with what I'm saying now. This time I'm representing the City and I have had conversations with other officers and people we stated.

It is possible that maybe some were done for that reason. I don't know for sure. I don't recall for sure. Most of the time, as I said, they were set for convenience. It appears to be set for convenience by the -- by somebody within the Strike Force supervision of where they were assigned and I believe that's consistent with what you just read.

Again, they were put in certain areas.

It was easier for them to do it there, but we did assign different places. Do I specifically remember a reason of why I put a checkpoint in a certain spot? I do not.

Q. I'll put the transcript away for now.

Based on your recollection and the testimony you reviewed just now and based on the preparations you took to -- you undertook to get ready for the deposition today, was it

the BPD's policy to require that checkpoint locations be selected based on traffic safety data?

- A. No. It wasn't a policy to be selected.

  Again, it was selected for, as I said, maybe reasons or no reason other than convenience.

  There was no policy to setup their Strike

  Force checkpoint based on traffic data, no.
- Q. Was it a policy of the BPD to require that checkpoints be selected based on the location of motor vehicle accidents?
- A. No. It was not a requirement, no.
  - Q. Was it a policy of the BPD to require that checkpoints are selected based on the location of red light violations?
- A. No.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- Q. Was it a policy of the BPD to require that checkpoints be selected based on the location of stop sign violations?
- A. No.
  - Q. Was it a policy of the BPD to require that checkpoints be selected on the basis of individuals driving without a license

infraction?

A. No.

- Q. Was it a policy of the BPD to require that checkpoint locations be selected on the basis of driving without a valid registration violation?
- A. No. That wouldn't make sense. How would I know where people are driving without valid registrations?
- Q. Okay. And was it a policy of the BPD to select checkpoint locations based on the location of where motorists were stopped for driving without valid inspection stickers?
- A. No.
- Q. Was it a policy of the BPD to require individuals involved in checkpoint selection to review traffic safety data before making their selection?
- A. No.
- Q. Was it a policy of the BPD to require individuals involved in checkpoint location selection to review 311 data concerning traffic incidents?

A. Policy, no.

- Q. Are you aware sitting here today of any instances where checkpoint locations were selected based on the incidence of driving without a license infraction?
- A. Again, driving without a license infraction can occur anywhere, so the answer to that is no. How would you gather data where people drive without licenses or inspections or others?
- Q. Well, wouldn't you have ticketing information concerning where people have been ticketed for those infractions in the past?
- A. I don't even think past would reference -- if
  I was driving without a license in Cheektowaga
  and got pulled over and got a ticket there,
  and then I was driving in Lancaster -- I don't
  how you would correlate that, but no, there
  was no policy.
- Q. And you have no information to suggest that motorists drove without a license in C

  District more often than A District, for instance?

A. No.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. You don't have any information suggesting that motorists were more likely to have an expired registration in E District over A District, for instance?
- A. I don't know how I would have that information.
- Q. But the BPD did have a practice of reviewing information concerning violent crime when selecting checkpoint locations, correct?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form.

- A. I didn't review violent crime for checkpoint locations. I reviewed crime and issues for Strike Force locations.
- Q. And checkpoints would be set in the areas where you had identified there to be crime patterns of concern, correct?

MR. SAHASRABUDHE: Objection as to form.

- A. Not always, but yes, they could have been and yes, they were at times.
- Q. And that was in fact a policy of numerous individuals in the supervisory command in the BPD, correct?

DEPAOLO CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC.

#### -DANIEL DERENDA

to a location where there was concerns about criminal activity?

- A. It appears there is a location that seems to be concerned about a lot of activity including V&T issues when it specifically states this includes enforcing V&T, conducting checkpoints in the area and a general disrupting of the criminal activity which means other.
- Q. Okay. And so as to my question, would you agree that this is an instance where the location of checkpoints was derived from reports about criminal activity in this instance taking place in the Towne Gardens area?
- A. This is a very brief paragraph. It doesn't totally layout what was said at that meeting. Were there comments about traffic safety?

  Were there comments about people violating

  V&T, speeding, running lights? I don't know.

Again, I can't comment. I can't give
you a full comment on one paragraph from
Captain Phil Serafini that I have never seen
or have any understanding of what took place

at that meeting that night back in 2017.

- Q. Are you aware that BPD officers used checkpoints -- used hot spot maps to determine the location of checkpoint locations?
- A. Checkpoint hot spot maps?
- Q. Hot spot maps, yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- A. Hot spot maps were used for locating the Strike Force. Again, that's -- Strike Force was assigned to hot spots and violent crime issues or whatever issues. I'm not aware of any hot spot map or I don't recall any hot spot maps for, quote, checkpoints.
- Q. I'm sorry if I misspoke. As far as the use of hot spot maps, you're aware that hot spot maps were used to at times determine where checkpoints would be located?
- A. I have no recollection of that whatsoever.
- Q. When Captain Serafini was giving commands to the Strike Force, Strike Force personnel, was it pursuant to authorities that he was delegated within the BPD?
- A. He was a captain within the BPD and that was a unit he was assigned to so he would have

- Q. But you agree that prior versions of Strike

  Force checkpoint reports did not in the manner

  of Exhibit 23 break down traffic -- the type

  of traffic summons by category, correct?
- A. I don't believe it did.
- Q. We have been talking a bit about traffic safety enforcement. But to confirm, when you refer to the checkpoints furthering the goal of traffic safety, you're referring to the enforcement of the New York State Vehicle and Traffic Laws or VTL, correct?
- A. Correct.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- Q. And VTL violations, those can be criminal offenses, correct?
  - A. Aggravated unlicensed operation to some degree, yes. There could be some criminal misdemeanor charge in there. It may be -- drunk driving could be a felony charge. Could be a criminal charge, yeah.
  - Q. But to confirm, the BPD did not study the impact of checkpoints on the commission of traffic safety violations within the City of Buffalo, correct?

- A. We did not.
- Q. I'd like to mark this as Exhibit 25. I'd like to walk you through the response to the Buffalo City Council's information request that we received. I will go ahead and put that on my screen. This will be Exhibit 25.

Can you see my screen, Mr. Derenda?

- A. Yes.
- Q. And it says BPD checkpoint data August through September, 2017?
- 11 A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Q. And if I scroll to the next page we see that I guess on your letterhead a dissemination to the Council -- President of the Buffalo City Council, Darius Pridgen, and to Council Member David Rivera, traffic safety checkpoint tally sheets from August 4th, 2017 to September 20th, 2017.

Do you see that?

- A. I do.
  - Q. And the transmission date of this message is September 21st, 2017?
- 23 A. Okay.

DEPAOLO CROSBY REPORTING SERVICES, INC.

#### -DANIEL DERENDA

- Q. But the checkpoints were not administered in a manner where motorists who are not suspected of Vehicle and Traffic Law violations could bypass the checkpoints entirely, correct?
- A. Correct. Everybody has to come through the checkpoint when you're in that motion and, again, there's nobody suspected of anything. They're coming through a checkpoint and they're being checked for certain things as stated.
- Q. Now, Mr. Derenda, you're aware that the complaint in this case alleges that checkpoints were predominantly on the East Side between 2013 and the conclusion of the program in 2017, correct?
- A. I believe that to be correct.
  - Q. Are you aware of any information that disproves the allegation that checkpoints were predominantly on the East Side during the period of the Strike Force's operation of that checkpoint?
  - A. I'm not aware of the actual breakdown of where the checkpoints were and what percentage, so

- I'm not aware of anything disputing what you're saying.
- Q. Okay. And in preparing for this deposition you did not undertake any review of checkpoint locations?
- A. I did not.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- Q. But you acknowledge receiving checkpoint locations as part of Strike Force daily reports during the time they were operating, correct?
- A. I acknowledge receiving Strike Force reports.

  I don't remember if they had the locations of the checkpoints on them. I don't know that to be the case. We did daily reports and it would have the area the Strike Force was assigned to, but I do know the directives have the location of the checkpoints and I believe, if I'm not mistaken, that's where the information was retrieved on where the locations were.
- Q. Did you have access to the checkpoint directives as commissioner?
  - A. I did not have access. Could I have had

1 STATE OF NEW YORK) 2 COUNTY OF ERIE 3 4 I, Rebecca Lynne DiBello, CSR, RPR, Notary 5 Public, in and for the County of Erie, State of New York, do hereby certify: 6 7 That the witness whose testimony appears hereinbefore was, before the commencement of 8 their testimony, duly sworn to testify the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth; that said testimony was taken pursuant 9 to notice at the time and place as herein set forth; that said testimony was taken down by me 10 and thereafter transcribed into typewriting, 11 and I hereby certify the foregoing testimony is a full, true and correct transcription of my shorthand notes so taken. 12 13 I further certify that I am neither counsel for nor related to any party to said action, 14 nor in anyway interested in the outcome thereof. 15 16 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto 17 subscribed my name and affixed my seal this 30th day of January, 2024. 18 Les I DiBello 19 20 21 Rebecca Lynne DiBello, CSR (NY) Notary Public - State of New York 22 No. 01D14897420 Qualified in Erie County 23 My commission expires 5/11/2027